

Birth in a Burning World

The Intersecting Extreme Heat & Maternal Health Crises in Sindh – A Qualitative Study

Table of Contents

Acronyms	3	
Executive Summary	4	
Introduction & Background	7	
Climate Change As An Emerging Threat		
Climate Change and Deadly Disasters in Pakistan	7	
Extreme Heat and Its Impacts	8	
The Human Body	9	
Thermal Inequality1	1	
Work & Working Conditions1	1	
Maternal Health and Birth Outcomes1	2	
Children's Health1	4	
Purpose & Methodology1	5	
Study Findings	7	
Extreme Heat and Maternal and Newborn Health in Pakistan1	7	
Exposure to Extreme Heat and Its Impacts1	8	
General Harms1	9	
Economic Consequences for Poor Families1	9	
Challenges for Unpaid Labor2	0	
Maternal and Children's Health Consequences	2	
Maternal Mental Health	2	
Dehydration	3	
Worries about Fetal Development	4	
Breastfeeding2	4	
Managing Extreme Heat	5	
Access to Information about Protective Measures2	6	
Gendered Differences in Access to Cooling	7	
Recommendations	8	
Global Recommendations		
Recommendations for Pakistan2		
Recommendations for Future Research2	9	

Acronyms

СОР	Conference of Parties
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ILO	International Labour Organization
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
LHW	Lady Health Worker
РРНІ	People's Primary Healthcare Initiative
WHO	World Health Organization

Executive Summary

Extreme heat worsened by climate change is deepening a maternal health crisis in Pakistan already marked by high rates of maternal and newborn deaths even when compared to most neighboring and other low-income countries.

Extreme heat is dangerous and can be deadly; in fact, it kills more people each year than any other weather-related disaster and sickens many more. Pregnancy health and fetal development are especially vulnerable to our increasingly hot world. Many studies link hotter than usual temperatures to increased rates of preterm birth and still birth. Preterm birth can have lifelong impacts on development, with increased risks of cerebral palsy, impaired learning, and physical and mental health complications. Increasingly, studies are showing links between extreme heat and maternal hospitalizations and higher rates of dangerous maternal health conditions, including hypertension.

While a substantial body of epidemiological research demonstrates links between elevated temperatures or temperatures higher than usual and negative pregnancy outcomes; there's a scarcity of literature providing comprehensive insights into the personal experiences of pregnant individuals managing extreme heat. This gap is particularly noticeable among economically disadvantaged women in low- or middle-income groups. Consequently, despite the growing importance of heat-related challenges due to the ongoing climate crisis, maternal healthcare providers have limited awareness of how these issues affect women in the most vulnerable communities.

To tackle this knowledge gap, this study aims to initiate the process of addressing the evidence and research shortage. It seeks to investigate whether pregnant women perceive extreme heat as more difficult to endure, and how instances of heatwaves have modified their encounters during pregnancy and early motherhood. The research also aims to reveal the strategies that women employ to cope with excessive heat and to pinpoint potential interventions that could enhance their capacity to develop resilience for themselves and their families.

This study utilizes both primary and secondary research. As a first step, epidemiological studies and other scientific findings showing links between poor maternal and newborn health and extreme heat were looked into. Following this a series of interviews were conducted with 16 women in Shikarpur District, Sindh Province, Pakistan, who were either pregnant or recently postpartum during the 2022 heatwave, as well as with five health providers and officials in the district. Epidemiologists, doctors, and other experts in maternal health and the climate crisis, were also consulted especially those regarding extreme heat exposure.

Of course, heat is only one dimension of the climate crisis, and the women interviewed for this study were also badly affected in 2022 by catastrophic climate crisis-driven flooding that submerged a third of the country and created one of the biggest humanitarian crises in recent years. They survived and struggled with illness, displacement, and loss due to this flooding. Given their experiences, this study provides some information on how the flooding created unique harms for these pregnant women, including by exposing them to even more humid heat under dismal conditions.

By doing so, the study provides a window into a major problem that evidence suggests is global: growing extreme heat—and the growing climate crisis more broadly—is having myriad deleterious impacts on maternal and newborn health and well-being with potentially lifelong consequences. Governments need to take urgent action to curb greenhouse gas emissions. While much can be done to reduce the harms of extreme heat including on pregnant people, there is no clear way for low-income communities to adapt their way out of burgeoning heat set to worsen without action.

Extreme heat, without alleviation through cooling, is a miserable experience. Interviewees described fainting in the heat, hospitalization because of dehydration, listlessness, loss of appetite, and struggling to manage pregnancy or a newborn and their work, which included farming, caring for

livestock, carrying water, and cooking over a hot fire. Some also shared their fears that extreme heat was harming their developing fetuses.

Already stressed by heavy workloads and the impact of patriarchal systems and poverty, interviewees reported that extreme heat negatively affected their emotional well-being, worsening their mood and coloring their experience of pregnancy or motherhood with exhaustion and anger. Women found that breastfeeding in the heat was particularly difficult both for them and for uncomfortably hot newborns. Extreme heat stole their sleep and the opportunity it provides to recuperate. Consequently interviewees were left tired, sweltering, and working through hot and sleepless nights with handwoven fans to manually cool babies and children since frequent blackouts disabled any electric fans.

Maternal mental health is another dimension of the crisis. The interviewees conveyed grief, despair, stress, and fear about losses from the flooding and about unyielding and oppressive heat in future summers, which are predicted to become longer. While more research is needed, this study suggests extreme heat may add further stress and worsen mental health for pregnant and postpartum women. This is worrying because pregnancy already increases the risk of mental health conditions, which are a major cause of global maternal morbidity and mortality.

A previous White Ribbon Alliance study noted that patriarchal systems across society play a role in the maternal health crisis. Patriarchal norms mean that women, even while heavily pregnant, may not have the power to renegotiate their roles and responsibilities with a male head of the household, even if extreme heat makes these duties a risk to the health of the mother and fetus or newborn. For example, water is essential to cooling, including bathing, and women bear the burden of carrying more water to meet their family's additional needs. Furthermore, many women in rural Sindh complete *chilla*, a traditional practice that includes not bathing, and thus lose its cooling benefits for 40 days after giving birth. Patriarchal systems also limit access to cool spaces on the basis of gender: while men have access to cool spaces in public, such as shops or shaded public areas, sociocultural norms continue to restrict women's ability to enjoy those locations.

Interviewees tried to cool themselves by using fans when they worked and especially by bathing in cool water, distracting themselves, or resting as much as their heavy workloads, including during pregnancy, allowed. Sometimes they slept outside to get some relief. They said that they need better access to cooling infrastructure, such as more trees planted around their homes, and cash transfers for cooling supplies such as electric fans, and batteries for solar panels. Interviewees also said they needed a reliable source of electricity (both day and night) to power fans. Those without access to water in their homes said they needed a handpump within easier reach. Interviewees also would greatly benefit from homes that are more resistant to heat (for example, ones made of cooler materials or with white-painted roofs), and cool spaces such as schools or clinics where women and children can find reprieve during the worst of the heat.

Climate scientists agree that more heat, both higher temperatures and for longer periods, is coming and Pakistan and the South Asia region will face more dangerous temperatures than most of the planet. This is the case even if serious global greenhouse gas emissions are cut immediately. If current emissions continue or rise further, the future will be even more hellish, and this is in spite of the fact that Pakistan is a relatively low-emission country, more so given its large population.

To help prevent climate-related disasters like the 2022 flooding and heatwave in Pakistan from increasing, both in strength and numbers, all countries, especially high-emission countries, should severely cut greenhouse gas emissions as advised by the United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC).

To improve maternal and newborn health, the government needs to act to protect the most vulnerable pregnant women and girls against extreme heat and other impacts. This means measurable actions to address the poor state of maternal and newborn health generally are required. Resources

to improve maternal and newborn health should include protection for women and newborns against climate harms on their health, including from extreme heat.

Governmental and non-governmental actions taken to address Pakistan's maternal health crisis should weave in climate adaptation and new protections to better assist pregnant people from blazing temperatures and other climate harms. Pregnant people need more education on extreme heat and its harms to pregnancy health, but that information needs to be actionable. Pregnant people also need better access to cooling at home and elsewhere and support to help them avoid heavy labor in the heat.

Although the IPCC has said that pregnant women and newborns are especially vulnerable to climate change, the country's government has yet to include maternal and newborn health in its climate adaptation plans. This needs to change. The government should include pregnant women and those who serve them most closely in its efforts to develop, implement, and monitor plans to improve maternal and newborn resilience to heat, flooding, drought, and other climate harms. All medical providers, including community health workers, such as the Lady Health Worker Program, should be better supported to provide heat health education tailored to pregnancy and newborn health.

Pakistan is not the only country that should consider maternal and newborn health in addressing climate change. Other countries should include maternal and newborn health in their climate adaptation plans in ways that reflect real not theoretical risks. However, this is frequently not the case, and reviews of climate adaptation plans show that maternal health is rarely included. When it is, "maternal health" or "pregnant women" is usually just one group in climate health lists of "at-risk" people. This checks a box but does little else, especially when considering the role of socioeconomic factors. The risks are very low for women with resources and good housing but high for marginalized and poor communities where women work and live with little protection. They are more vulnerable because of other stresses on their health, and have far less agency against the climate crisis. Furthermore, such lists usually omit "newborns," who are uniquely suspectable; even when "babies" appears, they are usually lumped with "children" despite facing different risks from those of older children.

Pakistan's government, alongside other affected countries and civil society, successfully pressed delegates at COP27, the 2022 iteration of the annual UN climate conference, to include loss and damage as an agenda item. Delegates agreed to establish a loss and damage fund that would move money from wealthy high-emitting countries to poorer countries most impacted by the consequences of burning fossil fuels. Pakistan's government called this decision a "victory." However, it remains to be seen how and when the fund will be filled, managed, or dispersed.

Finally, governments, including Pakistan's and donors, providing climate change funding should prioritize funding maternal and newborn health, which are especially vulnerable to the climate crisis and decide lifelong health. The country's government should allocate adequate financial and human resources to improving midwifery services and better supporting midwives, who are marginalized within the health system. Public health authorities, with the support of donors, should also provide the Lady Health Worker Program the resources and recognition it deserves. Pakistan's government should also ensure that contraceptive health, which is currently siloed, is comprehensively integrated into other healthcare services.

Introduction & Background

Climate Change As An Emerging Threat

Rising global temperatures due to human-made greenhouse gas emissions, mostly resulting from burning fossil fuels in industrialized nations, have led to a wide range of harmful impacts on humans and environmental systems, including extreme heat and sea level rise, and more frequent and intense extreme weather events like hurricanes, droughts, and floods. Human activities have already caused about 1°C of warming above pre-industrial levels, and global warming is likely to reach 1.5°C between 2030 and 2052 if global emissions continue increasing at their current rate.¹ Consequently, the small window of opportunity to prevent "catastrophic" global heating above 2°C is rapidly closing.² Deeper, repeating, and new harms await low-income and geographically and socially at-risk people.

Because of the climate crisis, the planet has become increasingly dangerous for pregnancy and childbirth. Higher temperatures make work during pregnancy harder and unhealthier, intensify air pollution, worsen rates of preterm and low-weight births, and make it harder for mothers and their newborns to sleep and breastfeed.³ Erratic rains threaten to flood homes or desiccate the crops that families rely on. Increasing wildfires contaminate the air with smoke containing toxics that cross the placenta and undermine maternal health.⁴ In some places, the climate crisis also drives other violations of women and girls' rights, such as forced and child marriage and deepens female poverty.⁵

The 2021 UN Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) report on governments' failures to adequately manage the climate crisis referenced multiple ways that it impacts pregnancy health⁶:

- Food insecurity, which disproportionately impacts women and girls.
- Infectious diseases, such as malaria and tick- and rodent-borne diseases, foodborne infections, and air pollution, all of which are greater hardships or dangers to pregnant people and mothers.
- Loss of water sources and water quality, as pregnant people need more water.
- Lack of water and lower quality water, which negatively impacts lactation and is associated with maternal, newborn, and child illness.
- Reduced access to prenatal and pediatric care as well as increasingly unattended deliveries, all of which are associated with extreme weather events.

Climate Change and Deadly Disasters in Pakistan

Pakistan faces some of "the highest disaster risk levels in the world" because of the climate crisis.⁷ Pakistan Floods 2022 Post Disaster Assessment Report provides a long list of climate-related problems for the country, including variations in precipitation and temperatures, increased frequency and severity of tropical storms and coastal rains, glacial melt, glacial lake outburst floods, sea level rise,

¹ Synthesis report of the IPXX Sixth Assessment Report, Summary for Policymakers, March 20, 2023, <u>https://report.ipcc.ch/ar6syr/pdf/IPCC_AR6_SYR_LongerReport.pdf</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).

² Ibid

³ Roos, N., Kovats, S., Hajat, S., Filippi, V., Chersich, M., Luchters, S., Scorgie, F., Nakstad, B., Stephansson, O., Hess, J., Kadio, K., Kouanda, S., Lusambili, A., Marsham, J., Ngugi, A., Wright, C. Y., & CHAMNHA Consortium (2021). Maternal and newborn health risks of climate change: A call for awareness and global action. Acta Obstetricia et Gynecologica Scandinavica. https://doi.org/10.1111/aogs.14124

⁴ Basilio E, Chen R, Fernandez AC, Padula AM, Robinson JF, Gaw SL. Wildfire Smoke Exposure during Pregnancy: A Review of Potential Mechanisms of Placental Toxicity, Impact on Obstetric Outcomes, and Strategies to Reduce Exposure. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. 2022; 19(21):13727. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph192113727

⁵ For example, see Heather Barr, Human Rights Watch, "Climate Change is Forcing Bangladeshi Girls into Child Marriage" https://www.hrw.org/news/2015/06/09/climate-change-forcing-bangladeshi-girls-child-marriage

⁶ IPCC, 2022: Climate Change 2022: Impacts, Adaptation, and Vulnerability. Contribution of Working Group II to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [H.-O. Pörtner, D.C. Roberts, M. Tignor, E.S. Poloczanska, K. Mintenbeck, A. Alegría, M. Craig, S. Langsdorf, S. Löschke, V. Möller, A. Okem, B. Rama (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK and New York, NY, USA, 3056 pp., doi:10.1017/9781009325844.

⁷ The World Bank Group and the Asian Development Bank, Climate Risk Country Profile: Pakistan (2021): p12 <u>https://climateknowledgeportal.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/2021-05/15078-WB Pakistan%20Country%20Profile-WEB.pdf</u> (accessed March 24, 2023).

seawater intrusion, extended and frequent riverine floods and heatwaves, loss of biodiversity, desertification, and droughts, all of which affect "economic and human development."⁸

In 2022, unusually massive flooding affected 30 million people in Pakistan.⁹ According to the World Bank, Sindh Province was the worst-affected province in the country, bearing about 70 percent of rebuilding costs.¹⁰ (See Textbox-01 "Mass Flooding in 2022: Harms to Interviewees" below for more on how the floods affected interviewees for this study.)

Scientists have blamed the intensity of both the heatwave and flooding on the climate crisis. World Weather Attribution Initiative's climate scientists reported that Pakistan's 2022 monsoon rainfall likely increased because of climate change and warned that rainfall intensity will further increase if global temperatures rise to 2°C above pre-industrial times.¹¹ A 2023 IPCC report said that "especially" in the South and South East Asian region (and some other areas), "continued global warming is projected to further intensify the global water system [including] monsoon precipitation."¹² Regarding the 2022 heatwave, which also crushed next-door India, World Weather Attribution Initiative determined that it was at least 30 times more likely because of anthropogenic climate change.¹³

Extreme Heat and Its Impacts

While there is no definition for "extreme heat," it is usually understood as a period of prolonged high temperatures relative to those usually expected. Climate scientists have high confidence that the duration, intensity, and likelihood of extreme heat has increased dramatically due to human-induced climate change."¹⁴

Rising extreme heat poses problems around the world, including in areas that are historically warmer at least part of the year like Sindh Province, Pakistan, and other parts of South Asia. In South Asia, an IPCC assessment concluded that there is "a high confidence in an increase in the intensity and frequency of hot extremes in the region, as well as a high confidence in a human contribution to the observed increase in the intensity and frequency of hot extremes."¹⁵ Further increases in extreme heat

⁸ Pakistan Ministry of Planning Development & Special Initiatives, Pakistan Floods 2022 Post Disaster Assessment Report, p12 <u>https://www.undp.org/pakistan/publications/pakistan-floods-2022-post-disaster-needs-assessment-pdna</u> (accessed March 24, 2023).

⁹ World Weather Attribution, "Climate change likely increased extreme monsoon rainfall, flooding highly vulnerable communities in Pakistan" September 14, 2022, <u>https://www.worldweatherattribution.org/wp-content/uploads/Pakistan-floods-scientific-report.pdf</u> (accessed March 24, 2023).

¹⁰ World Bank press release, October 28, 2022 <u>https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2022/10/28/pakistan-flood-damages-and-economic-losses-over-usd-30-billion-and-reconstruction-needs-over-usd-16-billion-new-assessme</u> (accessed March 24, 2023)

¹¹ World Weather Attribution, "Climate change likely increased extreme monsoon rainfall, flooding highly vulnerable communities in Pakistan" September 14, 2022, <u>https://www.worldweatherattribution.org/wp-content/uploads/Pakistan-floods-scientific-report.pdf</u> (accessed March 24, 2023). This report notes that while the IPCC has reported an increasing trend in extreme rainfall in South Asia and a scientific study has found an increasing strength and westward movement of the monsoon over Pakistan, there is "low confidence" in the finding that the observed extreme rainfall increase is due to human influence on the climate system in part because it is known that other factors also impact monsoon patterns, such as irrigation. See page 12.

¹² Synthesis Report of the IPCC Sixth Assessment Report, 2023, p34 <u>https://report.ipcc.ch/ar6syr/pdf/IPCC_AR6_SYR_LongerReport.pdf</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).

¹³ World Weather Attribution, report, "Climate Change made devastating early heat in India and Pakistan 30 times more likely". May 23, 2022 <u>India Pak-Heatwave-scientific-report.pdf (worldweatherattribution.org)</u> (accessed March 24, 2023)

¹³ Ibid. The study found that a heatwave like this one now has about a 1 in 100 chance of occurring in any given year. Before global warming began, the chances would have been at least about 1 in 3,000. And the chances would increase to as much as 1 in 5, the researchers said, if the world reaches 2 degrees Celsius of warming, as it is on track to do unless nations sharply reduce emissions.

¹⁴ IPCC, 2021: Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [Masson-Delmotte, V., P. Zhai, A. Pirani, S.L. Connors, C. Péan, S. Berger, N. Caud, Y. Chen, L. Goldfarb, M.I. Gomis, M. Huang, K. Leitzell, E. Lonnoy, J.B.R. Matthews, T.K. Maycock, T. Waterfield, O. Yelekçi, R. Yu, and B. Zhou (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA, In press, doi:<u>10.1017/9781009157896</u>.

¹⁵ Seneviratne et al. 2021 See also IPCC Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis <u>https://report.ipcc.ch/ar6/wq1/IPCC_AR6_WGI_FullReport.pdf</u> p1127 (accessed July 28, 2023).

as well as decreases in cold extremes are predicted for the region on all emission pathways, including if global warming only increases by 1.5°C.¹⁶

Even if new global greenhouse gas emissions are cut dramatically and swiftly, extreme heat will increase due to pre-existing carbon in the air. Nevertheless, it is critical to do so because unless emissions are reduced rapidly, heat in Pakistan will become an even bigger/greater problem. The Berkeley Earth Tracker's data suggests that Pakistan has already warmed 1.2°C since pre-industrial times and is headed for a 3.5°C increase by 2100 even in the best-case scenario, one where emissions are stabilized and then decline.¹⁷

Higher temperatures are linked to an increased risk of mortality and bad health outcomes, especially in infants, older people, people with disabilities, and people with respiratory or cardiac conditions.¹⁸ Increasing extreme heat in Pakistan also harms farming, like crops and animals, both of which have implications for families' incomes and nutrition and drive migration from rural areas to cities.¹⁹ In addition, heat can damage buildings, roads, and other infrastructure.²⁰

The Human Body

Extreme heat is deadly; indeed, "almost everywhere that reliable data is available, heatwaves are the deadliest weather-related hazard."²¹ For example, a heatwave in Europe in 2003 saw 70,000 additional deaths.²² Heat stroke deaths or others directly attributed to heat form only a small proportion of heat-related deaths.²³ Instead, heat exacerbates existing health conditions at a staggering rate: one study worried that 90 percent of existing global causes of death are worsened by heat.²⁴ Hospital admissions and deaths from chronic respiratory or heart diseases spike in hotter weather.²⁵ One study estimated 500,000 deaths per year from heat-related causes.²⁶

¹⁶ Seneviratne, S.I., X. Zhang, M. Adnan, W. Badi, C. Dereczynski, A. Di Luca, S. Ghosh, I. Iskandar, J. Kossin, S. Lewis, F. Otto, I. Pinto, M. Satoh, S.M. Vicente-Serrano, M. Wehner, and B. Zhou, 2021: Weather and Climate Extreme Events in a Changing Climate. In Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [Masson-Delmotte, V., P. Zhai, A. Pirani, S.L. Connors, C. Péan, S. Berger, N. Caud, Y. Chen, L. Goldfarb, M.I. Gomis, M. Huang, K. Leitzell, E. Lonnoy, J.B.R. Matthews, T.K. Maycock, T. Waterfield, O. Yelekçi, R. Yu, and B. Zhou (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA, pp. 1513–1766, doi:10.1017/9781009157896.013. p1638

 ¹⁷ Actionable Climate Science for Policy Makers, Berkeley Earth Tracker, <u>https://berkeleyearth.org/policy-insights/</u> (accessed March 24, 2023)
 ¹⁸ Hot weather and heat extremes: health risks, Ebi, Kristie L et al. The Lancet, Volume 398, Issue 10301, 698 – 708 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(21)01208-3</u>

¹⁹ IPCC Adaptation report, Asia chapter <u>https://report.ipcc.ch/ar6/wg2/IPCC_AR6_WGII_FullReport.pdf</u> p929 (accessed March 24, 2023)

²⁰ IPCC Adaptation report, chapter Six Cities, Settlements and Key Infrastructure, p907, https://report.ipcc.ch/ar6/wq2/IPCC AR6 WGII FullReport.pdf (accessed March 24, 2023)

²¹United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 p 5 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).

²² United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).

²³ United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).

²⁴ United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> p17 (accessed July 28, 2023).See also the Global Heat Health Information Network website https://ghin.org/heat-and-health/

²⁵ United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> p17

²⁶ Zhao Q, Guo Y, Ye T, Gasparrini A, Tong S, Overcenco A, Urban A, Schneider A, Entezari A, Vicedo-Cabrera AM, Zanobetti A, Analitis A, Zeka A, Tobias A, Nunes B, Alahmad B, Armstrong B, Forsberg B, Pan SC, Íñiguez C, Ameling C, De la Cruz Valencia C, Åström C, Houthuijs D, Dung DV, Royé D, Indermitte E, Lavigne E, Mayvaneh F, Acquaotta F, de'Donato F, Di Ruscio F, Sera F, Carrasco-Escobar G, Kan H, Orru H, Kim H, Holobaca IH, Kyselý J, Madureira J, Schwartz J, Jaakkola JJK, Katsouyanni K, Hurtado Diaz M, Ragettli MS, Hashizume M, Pascal M, de Sousa Zanotti Stagliorio Coélho M, Valdés Ortega N, Ryti N, Scovronick N, Michelozzi P, Matus Correa P, Goodman P, Nascimento Saldiva PH, Abrutzky R, Osorio S, Rao S, Fratianni S, Dang TN, Colistro V, Huber V, Lee W, Seposo X, Honda Y, Guo YL, Bell ML, Li S. Global, regional, and

But the problem of high temperatures precedes heatwaves. Importantly, heat-related deaths often begin rising long before hot weather becomes a heatwave or an emergency. In fact, "[t]he cumulative effects of low- and middle-intensity heatwaves on total and cause-specific mortality may, in fact, be greater than for high-intensity heatwaves."²⁷ This is likely because protective behavior changes more only after high temperatures reach official emergency levels.²⁸

Exposure to high temperatures can result in dehydration, reduced cognitive function, and heat stroke, which can exacerbate existing chronic conditions such as heart conditions, lung disease, kidney disease, and diabetes, and can be fatal.²⁹ Heat exposure can also increase the transmission of some diseases, be harmful to mental health, and alter human behavior.³⁰ Extreme heat "has negative impacts on … well-being, life satisfaction, happiness, cognitive performance and aggression."³¹

High and still rising nighttime temperatures are especially dangerous, as the body has a better chance to recuperate during cooler nights. Nighttime heat also negatively impacts sleep, which in turn has many negative implications for health.³² One estimate shows that by the end of the 21st century, if emissions continue to rise (a "high emissions scenario"), death rates from extreme heat could become comparable to those of all cancers or all infectious diseases worldwide.³³

Staying cool is critical because when the body is too hot, vital organs like the heart must work harder to cool it down.³⁴ Above 37°C (the optimal temperature for humans), the blood thickens, requiring the heart to work harder. Older people, people with disabilities, young children, and infants often struggle to effectively regulate their body temperatures while potentially being less aware of how the heat is affecting them. Moreover, heat has a disproportionate impact on people without access to cooling.

national burden of mortality associated with non-optimal ambient temperatures from 2000 to 2019: a three-stage modelling study. Lancet Planet Health. 2021 Jul;5(7):e415-e425. doi: 10.1016/S2542-5196(21)00081-4. PMID: 34245712.

²⁷ US Agency for International Development, Heat Waves and Human Health, Emerging Evidence and Experience to Inform Risk Management in a Warming World, February 2019 <u>https://www.climatelinks.org/sites/default/files/asset/document/2019_USAID-ATLAS_Heat-Waves-and-Human-Health.pdf</u> (accessed July 28, 2023)

²⁸ US Agency for International Development, Heat Waves and Human Health, Emerging Evidence and Experience to Inform Risk Management in a Warming World, February 2019 <u>https://www.climatelinks.org/sites/default/files/asset/document/2019 USAID-ATLAS Heat-Waves-and-Human-Health.pdf</u> (accessed July 28, 2023)

²⁹ Ebi, al. "Hot Risks." К. et Weather and Heat Extremes: Health The Lancet. (2021).https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(21)01208-3/fulltext Laurent, Jose Guillermo Cedeño, Augusta Williams, Youssef Oulhote, Antonella Zanobetti, Joseph G. Allen, and John D. Spengler. "Reduced Cognitive Function during a Heat Wave among Residents of Non-Air-Conditioned Buildings: An Observational Study of Young Adults in the Summer of 2016." PLOS Medicine, no. 7 (July 10, 2018): e1002605. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pmed.1002605

³⁰ Ryan, Sadie J. "Mapping Thermal Physiology of Vector-Borne Diseases in a Changing Climate: Shifts in Geographic and Demographic Risk of Suitability." Current Environmental Health Reports, no. 4 (December 2020): 415–23. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s40572-020-00290-5</u> Berry, Helen, Kathryn Bowen, and Tord Kjellstrom. "Climate Change and Mental Health: A Causal Pathways Framework." International Journal of Public Health, (April 1, 2010): 123–32. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00038-009-0112-0</u> Anderson, Craig A., Kathryn B. Anderson, Nancy Dorr, Kristina M. DeNeve, and Mindy Flanagan. "Temperature and Aggression." In Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, 32:63–133. Academic Press, (2000). <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2601(00)80004-0</u>

³¹ IPCC, 2022: Climate Change 2022: Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability. Contribution of Working Group II to the Sixth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [H.-O. Pörtner, D.C. Roberts, M. Tignor, E.S. Poloczanska, K. Mintenbeck, A. Alegría, M. Craig, S. Langsdorf, S. Löschke, V. Möller, A. Okem, B. Rama (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK and New York, NY, USA, 3056 pp., doi:10.1017/9781009325844. p1057

³² Minor, K. Bjerre-Nielsen, A., Svala Jonasdottir, S., Lehmann, S., Obradovich et al, Rising Temperatures Erode Human Sleep Globally, In One Earth, (May 20, 2022), <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/i.oneear.2022.04.008</u> and Daniel I. Rifkin, Michael W. Long, Melissa J. Perry, Climate change and sleep: A systematic review of the literature and conceptual framework, In Sleep Medicine Reviews, Volume 42, 2018, Pages 3-9, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.smrv.2018.07.007.

³³ Carleton, Tamma A, Amir Jina, Michael T Delgado, Michael Greenstone, Trevor Houser, Solomon M Hsiang, Andrew Hultgren, and Robert E Kopp. National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper Series. "Valuing the Global Mortality Consequences of Climate Change Accounting for Adaptation Costs and Benefits," National Bureau of Economic Research (2021), n.d., 49: <u>https://www.nber.org/papers/w27599</u>

³⁴ https://clinmedjournals.org/articles/iacph/international-archives-of-clinical-physiology-iacph-1-001.php

Thermal Inequality

Access to cooling is a lifesaving intervention. Air conditioning is highly protective, and fans and other cooling devices can help, although above certain temperatures, fans can dehydrate bodies further.³⁵ Increasing the number of trees and green spaces can also cool neighborhoods, and these and other infrastructural efforts, like improving building insulation and painting roofs white, are gaining attention as ways to reduce heat.³⁶ But not everyone can afford or otherwise access cooled air; for example, not everyone can go to cooler shops or other public places. These victims of "thermal inequality" are frequently the least responsible for the climate crisis; living in poor quality, hotter housing, and/or hotter less-green neighborhoods (dramatic differences in temperatures within cities are common, even within small areas); and/or laboring in high temperatures.

Climate scientists have determined that Pakistan is a country where "intense and frequent heatwaves will render coping mechanisms inadequate as conditions in some regions meet and exceed limits to human survivability."³⁷ While acclimatization to heat is protective, mortality increases dramatically when temperatures exceed 40°C, even in places where people are "used to" heat.³⁸ Additionally, according to a joint UN-ICRC report, "acclimatization wanes in the absence of prolonged heat exposure ... it affords less protection against the types of abrupt and unusual changes in humidity and temperature made more likely by climate change."³⁹

Work & Working Conditions

Low-income people usually must continue working regardless of the heat. Work is often unhealthily hot for low-income people. For example, harvesting food is often "piece work" (work paid for by the amount produced rather than paid by the hour), so workers are under pressure to labor hard despite dangerous temperatures.

The International Labour Organization (ILO) has noted that all over the world, countries with high and rising temperatures may not have or adhere to worker protections and that workers may often work without breaks, shade or other cooling, or enough water.⁴⁰ As such, addressing heat in the workplace is a labor rights priority for the climate crisis.

Our understanding of the relationship between heat and work has often focused on paid labor, in fields and factories, for example. However, globally, the labor burden of rural women is probably greater than that of men and much is unpaid and not done in a traditional workplace.⁴¹ Therefore, traditional labor protections, even if they are strengthened, will do little for millions of subsistence farmers, mostly women, including in the many areas set to experience significant increases in temperatures in Africa and Southeast Asia. There is little research on the unique risks to pregnant people working in high-temperature agriculture of any type or on women who do subsistence

³⁵ The Global Heat Health Information Network, co-hosted by the World Meteorological Society and the World Health Organization provides a library of resources on extreme heat, health effects and research on cooling methods. Please see <u>https://ghhin.org/resource-library/</u> and Cooling Strategies from The Lancet <u>cooling-strategies-1648207816290.pdf</u> (thelancet.com)

³⁶ Ibid

³⁷ World Weather Attribution, report, "Climate Change made devastating early heat in India and Pakistan 30 times more likely". May 23, 2022 <u>India Pak-Heatwave-scientific-report.pdf (worldweatherattribution.org)</u> (accessed March 24, 2023)

³⁸ World Weather Attribution, report, "Climate Change made devastating early heat in India and Pakistan 30 times more likely". May 23, 2022 <u>India Pak-Heatwave-scientific-report.pdf (worldweatherattribution.org)</u> (accessed March 24, 2023), See also Desai et al., 2015; Rathi and Sodani, 2021; Rathi, Sodani and Joshi, 2021

³⁹ United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> p 16

⁴⁰ International Labour Organization, Working on a Warmer Planet, The Impact of Heat Stress on Worker Productivity and Decent Work. Geneva, ILO, 2019, https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_711919.pdf
⁴¹ Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome, 2010-2011 The State of Food and Agriculture: The role of women in agriculture, 2011.

farmwork. One important exception is the recent work on pregnant subsistence farmers in The Gambia (see 'Maternal Health and Birth Outcomes' section below).⁴²

Furthermore, improving labor standards in places where paid work occurs will not provide protection for work in the home, caring for children and others, carrying water, cooking over hot fires and other work. A response to extreme heat that includes care work and subsistence work is necessary to address unpaid labor dimensions.

Maternal Health and Birth Outcomes

Heat exposure during pregnancy is linked to adverse birth outcomes, many of which can have lifelong impacts. Many studies have found an association between increased heat exposure and the risk of preterm birth and stillbirth,⁴³ even with small changes in temperature.⁴⁴ For example, a recent analysis of 70 studies across 27 countries found that with every 1°C rise in temperature, the risk of preterm birth increased.⁴⁵ Preterm birth can have lasting impacts on neurodevelopment, with increased risks of cerebral palsy, impaired learning, and physical and mental health complications.^{46,47}

High temperatures may also increase the risk of some congenital anomalies, including heart defects (for which there is strong evidence),^{48,49} as well as spina bifida and craniofacial differences (although research on both is more limited).⁵⁰

Studies are also finding links between extreme heat and maternal physical health complications. Research shows that heat exposure during pregnancy is associated with increased emergency hospital admissions, gestational diabetes, and pre-eclampsia.⁵¹ One recent study found that high temperatures in early pregnancy in particular are associated with an increased risk of severe hypertensive

⁴² Bonell A, Sonko B, Badjie J, Samateh T, Saidy T, Sosseh F, Sallah Y, Bajo K, Murray KA, Hirst J, Vicedo-Cabrera A, Prentice AM, Maxwell NS, Haines A. Environmental heat stress on maternal physiology and fetal blood flow in pregnant subsistence farmers in The Gambia, west Africa: an observational cohort study. Lancet Planet Health. 2022 Dec;6(12):e968-e976. doi: 10.1016/S2542-5196(22)00242-X. PMID: 36495891; PMCID: PMC9756110, AND Spencer Shantelle, Samateh Tida, Wabnitz Katharina, Mayhew Susannah, Allen Haddijatou, Bonell Ana "The Challenges of Working in the Heat Whilst Pregnant: Insights From Gambian Women Farmers in the Face of Climate Change" Frontiers in Public Health VOLUME=10 YEAR= https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpubh.2022.785254

⁴³ Roos N, Kovats S, Hajat S, et al. Maternal and newborn health risks of climate change: A call for awareness and global action. Acta Obstet Gynecol Scand. 2021;100:566–570. https://doi.org/10.1111/aogs.14124

⁴⁴ Chersich MF, Pham MD, Areal A, Haghighi MM, Manyuchi A, Swift CP, Wernecke B, Robinson M, Hetem R, Boeckmann M, Hajat S; Climate Change and Heat-Health Study Group. Associations between high temperatures in pregnancy and risk of preterm birth, low birth weight, and stillbirths: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ. 2020 Nov 4;371:m3811. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m3811. PMID: 33148618; PMCID: PMC7610201.

⁴⁵ Chersich MF, Pham MD, Areal A, Haghighi MM, Manyuchi A, Swift CP, Wernecke B, Robinson M, Hetem R, Boeckmann M, Hajat S; Climate Change and Heat-Health Study Group. Associations between high temperatures in pregnancy and risk of preterm birth, low birth weight, and stillbirths: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ. 2020 Nov 4;371:m3811. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m3811. PMID: 33148618; PMCID: PMC7610201.; Samuels, Louisa, Britt Nakstad, Nathalie Roos, Ana Bonell, Matthew Chersich, George Havenith, Stanley Luchters, et al. 2022. "Physiological Mechanisms of the Impact of Heat during Pregnancy and the Clinical Implications: Review of the Evidence from an Expert Group Meeting." International Journal of Biometeorology 66 (8): 1505–13. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00484-022-02301-6</u>.

⁴⁶ https://www.nature.com/articles/pr2013204

⁴⁷ Soleimani, Farin, Farzaneh Zaheri, and Fatemeh Abdi. 2014. "Long-Term Neurodevelopmental Outcomes After Preterm Birth." Iranian Red Crescent Medical Journal 16 (6): e17965. <u>https://doi.org/10.5812/ircmj.17965</u>.

⁴⁸ Haghighi, Marjan Mosalman, Caradee Yael Wright, Julian Ayer, Michael F. Urban, Minh Duc Pham, Melanie Boeckmann, Ashtyn Areal, et al. 2021. "Impacts of High Environmental Temperatures on Congenital Anomalies: A Systematic Review." International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health 18 (9): 4910. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18094910</u>.

⁴⁹ https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3491926/

⁵⁰ Haghighi, Marjan Mosalman, Caradee Yael Wright, Julian Ayer, Michael F. Urban, Minh Duc Pham, Melanie Boeckmann, Ashtyn Areal, et al. 2021. "Impacts of High Environmental Temperatures on Congenital Anomalies: A Systematic Review." International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health 18 (9): 4910. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18094910</u>

⁵¹ Samuels, L., Nakstad, B., Roos, N. et al. Physiological mechanisms of the impact of heat during pregnancy and the clinical implications: review of the evidence from an expert group meeting. Int J Biometeorol **66**, 1505–1513 (2022). https://doi.org/10.1007/s00484-022-02301-6 See also Shashar et al. 2020; Pace et al. 2021

disorders.⁵² In addition, studies suggest that higher than normal temperatures are associated with a heightened risk of experiencing cardiovascular events during labor or delivery.⁵³

Extreme heat may also negatively impact maternal mental health, as heat exposure is linked to emotional stress during pregnancy.⁵⁴ Hot weather can disrupt sleep patterns, and poor sleep quality is associated with an increased risk for depression among pregnant women.⁵⁵ This is particularly concerning given the already elevated risk of experiencing mental health conditions, including depression, during and after pregnancy.⁵⁶

Some pregnant women and newborns may face greater risks due to heat than others. For example, links between temperature and outcomes, like preterm birth and stillbirth, are strongest among groups of pregnant women with lower socioeconomic status and who are at age extremes.⁵⁷ In the United States, historical and current racism has already resulted in a Black maternal health crisis where preterm birth, low-birth weight, and infant death rates are twice as high for Black mothers as white ones. Several studies found greater effects of higher-than-normal temperatures on adverse birth outcomes for Black mothers compared to white ones suggesting that increasing temperatures are exacerbating inequities.⁵⁸

A recent study of pregnant farmworkers in The Gambia found that pregnant subsistence farmers are frequently exposed to extreme heat stress, leading to maternal heat strain.⁵⁹ The study concluded that maternal heat strain is significantly associated with fetal strain.⁶⁰ Women form about half of the agricultural workforce in The Gambia. A separately published qualitative study by the same team that found evidence of fetal strain also found that "layered identities, experiences, and household power structures shaped the extent to which women who participated in the study were able to prevent and reduce the effects of heat exposure during their work while pregnant" and that a "predominantly patriarchal society … limited their access to resources … and ability to take adaptive action to mitigate

⁵²Part C, le Roux J, Chersich M, Sawry S, Filippi V, Roos N, Fairlie L, Nakstad B, de Bont J, Ljungman P, Stafoggia M, Kovats S, Luchters S, Hajat S. Ambient temperature during pregnancy and risk of maternal hypertensive disorders: A time-to-event study in Johannesburg, South Africa. Environ Res. 2022 Sep;212(Pt D):113596. doi: 10.1016/j.envres.2022.113596. Epub 2022 Jun 2. PMID: 35661733.

⁵³ Ha, Sandie, Kelly Nguyen, Danping Liu, Tuija Männistö, Carrie Nobles, Seth Sherman, and Pauline Mendola. 2017. "Ambient Temperature and Risk of Cardiovascular Events at Labor and Delivery: A Case-Crossover Study." Environmental Research 159 (November): 622–28. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/i.envres.2017.09.010</u>; Xiong, Tao, Peiran Chen, Yi Mu, Xiaohong Li, Baofeng Di, Jierui Li, Yi Qu, Jun Tang, Juan Liang, and Dezhi Mu. 2020. "Association between Ambient Temperature and Hypertensive Disorders in Pregnancy in China." Nature Communications 11 (1): 2925. <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-020-16775-8</u>; Shashar, Sagi, Itai Kloog, Offer Erez, Alexandra Shtein, Maayan Yitshak-Sade, Batia Sarov, and Lena Novack. 2020. "Temperature and Preeclampsia: Epidemiological Evidence That Perturbation in Maternal Heat Homeostasis Affects Pregnancy Outcome." PLoS ONE 15 (5): e0232877. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/iournal.pone.0232877</u>; Wang, Jiaqi, Xin Liu, Moran Dong, Xiaoli Sun, Jianpeng Xiao, Weilin Zeng, Jianxiong Hu, et al. 2020. "Associations of Maternal Ambient Temperature Exposures during Pregnancy with the Placental Weight, Volume and PFR: A Birth Cohort Study in Guangzhou, China." Environment International 139 (June): 105682. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/i.envint.2020.105682</u>.

⁵⁴ Lin Y, Hu W, Xu J, et al. "Association between temperature and maternal stress during pregnancy." Environmental Research. 2017;158:421-430. doi:10.1016/j.envres.2017.06.034

⁵⁵ Gao M, Hu J, Yang L, Ding N, Wei X, Li L, Liu L, Ma Y, Wen D. Association of sleep quality during pregnancy with stress and depression: a prospective birth cohort study in China. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth. 2019 Nov 27;19(1):444. doi: 10.1186/s12884-019-2583-1. PMID: 31775666; PMCID: PMC6882237.

⁵⁶ Wang, Z., Liu, J., Shuai, H. et al. Mapping global prevalence of depression among postpartum women. Transl Psychiatry **11**, 543 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41398-021-01663-6

⁵⁷ Chersich MF, Pham MD, Areal A, Haghighi MM, Manyuchi A, Swift CP, Wernecke B, Robinson M, Hetem R, Boeckmann M, Hajat S; Climate Change and Heat-Health Study Group. Associations between high temperatures in pregnancy and risk of preterm birth, low birth weight, and stillbirths: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ. 2020 Nov 4;371:m3811. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m3811. PMID: 33148618; PMCID: PMC7610201.

⁵⁸ CDC, Preterm Birth, webpage https://www.cdc.gov/reproductivehealth/features/prematurebirth/index.html#:~:text=Preterm%20Birth%20in%20the%20United%20States&text=However%2C%20racial%20and%20ethnic%20differenc es,or%20Hispanic%20women%20(10.2%25).

⁵⁹ Bonell, Ana, Bakary Sonko, Jainaba Badjie, Tida Samateh, Tida Saidy, Fatou Sosseh, Yahya Sallah, et al. 2022. "Environmental Heat Stress on Maternal Physiology and Fetal Blood Flow in Pregnant Subsistence Farmers in The Gambia, West Africa: An Observational Cohort Study." The Lancet Planetary Health 6 (12): e968–76. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S2542-5196(22)00242-X</u>.

⁶⁰ Bonell, Ana, Bakary Sonko, Jainaba Badjie, Tida Samateh, Tida Saidy, Fatou Sosseh, Yahya Sallah, et al. 2022. "Environmental Heat Stress on Maternal Physiology and Fetal Blood Flow in Pregnant Subsistence Farmers in The Gambia, West Africa: An Observational Cohort Study." The Lancet Planetary Health 6 (12): e968–76. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S2542-5196(22)00242-X</u>.

their risk of heat stress." Sometimes, when women were unable to work, less food was cultivated as a result.

Though research in this field is ongoing, it is clear that pregnant women and newborns are uniquely vulnerable to rising temperatures. ⁶¹ As such, they will require unique support to adapt to our warming world and must be included as an at-risk class for heat exposure.⁶² Given this it is indeed a matter of concerned that the country's government has yet to include maternal and newborn health in its climate adaptation plans. ⁶³

Children's Health

Children are also more likely to be affected by respiratory disease, renal disease, electrolyte imbalance, and fever during persistent hot weather.⁶⁴ These associations may be explained partly by the fact that very young children have a high body surface to volume ratio, which increases relative exposure to temperature.⁶⁵ Furthermore, children sweat less than adults and may have limited ability to avoid or reduce heat exposure, rendering them less able to self-regulate temperature.⁶⁶ Heat can also have detrimental impact on children's ability to learn.⁶⁷

Children in low-income settings are uniquely vulnerable to the health impacts of heat due to preexisting burdens of infection, undernutrition, poor healthcare systems, and dwellings that do not provide sufficient protection from the heat.⁶⁸ Heat exposure may even worsen these health conditions. For example, in some regions, extreme heat has been linked to an increased prevalence of both chronic and acute malnutrition.⁶⁹

Rising temperatures caused by climate change are already undermining improvements made to children's health. One study found that by 2009, heat-related child mortality in Africa was double what it would have been without climate change; this impact outweighed reductions in heat mortality that resulted from improvements associated with social development.⁷⁰ This phenomenon is particularly concerning given that childhood exposure to extreme heat events is projected to increase.⁷¹

⁶³ https://docc.sindh.gov.pk/files/DoCC/Documents/NAP%20Final%20Draft-edited.pdf

⁷⁰ Sarah Chapman et al 2022 Environ. Res. Lett. **17** 074028

⁶¹ Lakhoo DP, Blake HA, Chersich MF, Nakstad B, Kovats S. The Effect of High and Low Ambient Temperature on Infant Health: A Systematic Review. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2022 Jul 26;19(15):9109. doi: 10.3390/ijerph19159109. PMID: 35897477; PMCID: PMC9331681.

⁶² Chersich MF, Pham MD, Areal A, Haghighi MM, Manyuchi A, Swift CP, Wernecke B, Robinson M, Hetem R, Boeckmann M, Hajat S; Climate Change and Heat-Health Study Group. Associations between high temperatures in pregnancy and risk of preterm birth, low birth weight, and stillbirths: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ. 2020 Nov 4;371:m3811. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m3811. PMID: 33148618; PMCID: PMC7610201.

⁶⁴ Xu, Z., Sheffield, P.E., Su, H. *et al*. The impact of heat waves on children's health: a systematic review.*Int J Biometeorol* **58**, 239–247 (2014). https://doi.org/10.1007/s00484-013-0655-x

⁶⁵ Lakhoo, Darshnika Pemi, Helen Abigail Blake, Matthew Francis Chersich, Britt Nakstad, and Sari Kovats. 2022. "The Effect of High and Low Ambient Temperature on Infant Health: A Systematic Review." International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health 19 (15): 9109. <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19159109</u>.

⁶⁶Vergunst, F., & Berry, H. L. (2022). Climate Change and Children's Mental Health: A Developmental Perspective. Clinical Psychological Science, 10(4), 767–785. <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/21677026211040787</u>

⁶⁷ See for example in Human Rights Watch, "Australia: Extreme Heat Threatens Lives" photograph essay, 2022

⁶⁸ Sheffield PE, Landrigan PJ. Global climate change and children's health: threats and strategies for prevention. Environ Health Perspect. 2011 Mar;119(3):291-8. doi: 10.1289/ehp.1002233. Epub 2010 Oct 14. PMID: 20947468; PMCID: PMC3059989. Charlotta Rylander, Jon Øyvind Odland & Torkjel Manning Sandanger (2013) Climate change and the potential effects on maternal and pregnancy outcomes: an assessment of the most vulnerable – the mother, fetus, and newborn child, Global Health Action, 6:1, 19538, DOI: 10.3402/gha.v6i0.19538
⁶⁹ Sylvia Blom, Ariel Ortiz-Bobea, John Hoddinott, Heat exposure and child nutrition: Evidence from West Africa, Journal of Environmental

Sylvia Biom, Ariel Ortiz-Bobea, John Hodainott, Heat exposure and child nutrition: Evidence from West Africa, Journal of Environmental Economics and Management, Volume 115, 2022, 102698, ISSN 0095-0696, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeem.2022.102698.

⁷¹ UNICEF, 2022, "The Coldest Year of the Rest of their Lives," https://www.unicef.org/reports/coldest-year-rest-of-their-lives-childrenheatwaves

Purpose & Methodology

Purpose

The study's primary focus is to fill a critical void in the existing research regarding the personal experiences of pregnant and lactating women dealing with high temperatures. Despite established connections between elevated temperatures and adverse pregnancy outcomes, little is known about how pregnant & lactating women, especially those from economically disadvantaged backgrounds, navigate extreme heat. This gap becomes even more pronounced in low- or middle-income groups. As the climate crisis intensifies, it's becoming essential to understand the unique challenges that heat poses to maternal health, particularly among vulnerable communities.

To address this knowledge gap, the study aims to kickstart the process of bridging the lack of evidence and research in this area. It seeks to explore whether pregnant & lactating women perceive extreme heat as more challenging to endure and how heatwaves specifically alter their experiences during pregnancy and early motherhood. Additionally, the research strives to uncover the various strategies that pregnant & lactating women employ to cope with excessive heat. Moreover, the study intends to identify potential interventions that could empower these women to build resilience for themselves and their families in the face of these challenges. Ultimately, the purpose of this research is to shed light on the personal dimensions of managing extreme heat during pregnancy and lactation and to inform maternal healthcare providers about the specific needs and experiences of vulnerable communities.

Methodology

The research initiative commenced with a comprehensive desk-based exploration, directed towards the available epidemiological data relating to the influence of extreme heat on maternal and newborn health. This endeavor encompassed an exhaustive review of scholarly and grey literature, with a specific concentration on the maternal health landscape within Pakistan, particularly focusing on the Sindh region.

For the establishment of study's framework, a qualitative research methodology was adopted. Under this, the participant cohort comprised 21 individuals, inclusive of 16 women who were either pregnant or in the lactation phase (eight individuals in each category). For the identification of women a convenience sampling approach was adopted whereby Lady Health Workers (LHWs), given their distinctive insight into the realm of pregnant and lactating women, were engaged with. Additionally, insightful dialogues were conducted with two local officials and three healthcare providers, individuals whose experiential insights were directly pertinent to maternal health in the context of extreme heat conditions.

The decision to work with a sample size of 21 was informed by the established principle in qualitative studies that data saturation, typically requiring a minimum of 12 participants, is crucial for comprehensive exploration. This methodological consideration, as affirmed by researchers such as Clarke & Braun (2013), Fugard & Potts (2014), and Guest, Bunce, & Johnson (2006), facilitated a thorough examination of the phenomenon under study and effective engagement with the research inquiry.

The study was undertaken in District Shikarpur in Sindh, which is not only renowned for its elevated temperatures, but notably, had also experienced significant impact during the calamitous floods of 2022. Consequently, it was ensured that the women were drawn from households affected by this natural disaster, either directly or indirectly.

For the purpose of collecting data from the participant cohort, semi-structured interview guidelines were developed separately for women, health care providers and officials⁷². Receipt of ethical

⁷² The interview guidelines for all three groups are given at Annex-A.

clearance, both for the research methodology as well as for the developed tools, from the concerned authorities was also ensured.

Interviews were conducted in Sindhi or in a mix of Sindhi and Urdu. All interviewees provided consent after receiving an overview of the questionnaire's contents, an estimate of how long the interview would take, and a detailed description of planned reporting and dissemination of results. No payment was provided for interviews, and interviewees were told there were no consequences for not participating. Names of participants have been removed in accordance with research regulations.

Conducted during the period spanning September to October in 2022, the interviews were subsequently transcribed and translated for an in-depth analytical exploration. The qualitative data underwent meticulous review and was subjected to a comprehensive analysis, culminating in the creation of a comprehensive report, with the aim of providing a profound understanding of pregnant & lactating women's experiences amidst extreme heat, delineating instances of heightened impact, emotional responses, and the strategies employed to navigate these challenging circumstances.

Study Findings

Extreme Heat and Maternal and Newborn Health in Pakistan

The impacts of the climate crisis, including extreme heat, exacerbate Pakistan's maternal and newborn health outcomes, which are poor even in comparison to other low-income countries. In August 2022, Forum for Safe Motherhood (White Ribbon Alliance Pakistan Chapter) conducted a landscape analysis, *Ending Preventable Maternal Mortality and Early Newborn Action Plan in Pakistan*, including examples from Sindh, on how policy and funding gaps and poor oversight of private healthcare providers undermine maternal and newborn health.⁷³ That report concluded that "[o]ver the past several decades the government's interventions in maternal and child health have been partial, disintegrated, erratic and unsustainable."⁷⁴

While Pakistan's neighbors, except Afghanistan, have reduced fertility rates to 2.1 births per woman or below over the past several decades, Pakistan's has remained high at 3.6 per woman and only declined marginally since 2012-13 when it was 3.8 births per woman.⁷⁵ High fertility rates are partly due to poor government structuring of services and failing commodity chains.⁷⁶ For example, since the Department of Population Welfare provides maternal, newborn, and child health and family planning services separately, healthcare providers are not held accountable for providing either information about or access to contraception. The landscape analysis recommends a centralized approach by relocating all family planning service delivery points to health facilities, noting that despite high-level governmental concerns about high rates of unwanted pregnancies and population growth, "momentum [is] yet to be seen as action at service delivery level."

Even in comparison to its neighbors, Pakistan also suffers from high maternal and neonatal mortality rates. In 2019, Pakistan's maternal mortality rate was about 186 per 100,000 births. This is higher than in neighboring countries, except Afghanistan. And during the past decade, Pakistan's neonatal mortality rate has fluctuated between 42 to 54 per 1,000 live births, whereas its regional neighbors have neonatal mortality rates of less than 20 per 1,000 births. Finally, Pakistan's perinatal mortality rate, which includes stillbirths and deaths in the first week of life, is 70 per 1,000 total births, which is high compared to other middle- and low-income countries. 63 percent of deaths of children under five in Pakistan are newborns.⁷⁷

Worryingly, although government data indicates that coverage has improved over the past several decades—for example, more women receive antenatal care and skilled birth attendance—fertility and neonatal and perinatal mortality rates have not, suggesting a gap in the implementation of adequate care. The landscape analysis also found no significant improvement in access to emergency obstetric care and that, as far as its researchers could find, the government had not established referral systems from more local health centers to emergency care.⁷⁸

A 2020 study of a small sample of pregnancies found a very high rate of preterm birth: more than 21 percent of all births were preterm (globally, about 10 percent of babies are born preterm, but rates

⁷³ AUTHOR, Forum for Safe Motherhood (White Ribbon Alliance Pakistan Chapter), Ending Preventable Maternal Mortality and Early Newborn Action Plan in Pakistan, August 2022.

⁷⁴ Ibid

⁷⁵ See p8 AUTHOR, Forum for Safe Motherhood (White Ribbon Alliance Pakistan Chapter), Ending Preventable Maternal Mortality and Early Newborn Action Plan in Pakistan LINK, August 2022. See also Pakistan Demographic and Health Survey (PDHS) of 2017-18.

⁷⁶ United Nations Population Fund Pakistant, "What we do: Family Planning" webpage <u>https://pakistan.unfpa.org/en/topics/family-planning-9</u> (accessed July 28, 2023). See also Jabeen, S., Rathor, A., Riaz, M. et al. Demand- and supply-side factors associated with the use of contraceptive methods in Pakistan: a comparative study of demographic and health surveys, 1990–2018. BMC Women's Health **20**, 265 (2020). <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s12905-020-01112-4</u>

⁷⁷ P33 AUTHOR Forum for Safe Motherhood (White Ribbon Alliance Pakistan Chapter), Ending Preventable Maternal Mortality and Early Newborn Action Plan in Pakistan LINK, August 2022. See also Healthy Newborn Network Pakistan https://www.healthynewbornnetwork.org/country/pakistan/

⁷⁸ P26 AUTHOR, Forum for Safe Motherhood (White Ribbon Alliance Pakistan Chapter), Ending Preventable Maternal Mortality and Early Newborn Action Plan in Pakistan LINK, August 2022.

are highly variable from 5 to 18 percent).⁷⁹ In addition, according to a large-scale study, almost one in four newborns are reported as having low-birth weight and newborns with low-birth weight in Pakistan are at higher risk of developing wasting (low weight for height) and stunting (retardation of linear growth).⁸⁰

The Global Network for Women and Children's Health Research and Aga Khan University in Karachi have a maternal and newborn health surveillance system in Thatta District, Sindh Province.⁸¹ Between 2010 and 2018, the maternal mortality rate there was about 319 per 100,000 live births, which is significantly higher than the average maternal mortality rate of 125 per 100,000 live births in the Network's other six sites (in Argentina, Democratic Republic of Congo, Guatemala, India, and Zambia). Furthermore, in the Pakistan site, the neonatal mortality rate was 49 per 1,000 live births and the stillbirth rate was 54 per 1,000 total births, compared to averages of 20 and 23, respectively, in the other six sites. The study attributed the gap to poverty, low literacy, and poor quality of available maternal and newborn health services in the Pakistan site.

Fortunately, there are opportunities to repair Pakistan's maternal health infrastructure. The landscaping analysis report recommends strengthening and remodeling the Lady Health Worker Program, a community health worker program that provides a first point of contact between families and health systems, antenatal care, family planning, and referrals for facility-based deliveries and family planning services at the community level. Introduced in the 1990s, this program successfully brought reproductive health services to many rural women. Despite its significant potential, the program has been under resourced everywhere and all but abandoned in one province. Across Pakistan, the much-needed expansion of health workers to the program never materialized, funding dwindled, and management remained poor. Much better support to midwives, who currently feel less supported and respected than other providers, should also be a priority, including by making maternal care more responsive and respectful, which policymakers have identified as important.

The findings of this study on how the climate crisis is worsening maternal health reinforce a key recommendation from the landscape analysis: Pakistan should create a plan to prepare its healthcare system to provide essential reproductive healthcare during disasters. The landscape analysis also found that maternal and newborn health services were not well-coordinated with other sectors whose work contributes to saving maternal and newborn lives, such as sanitation, education, and nutrition services. Better coordination is needed not only for public health gains and disaster preparedness, but also for climate adaptation, which must be inherently intersectoral. In fact, the climate crisis is pressing governments all over the world to break down silos to make sure, for example, communities at risk from extreme heat receive adequate public health messaging and have access to better-designed housing, public spaces, and transport infrastructure.

Exposure to Extreme Heat and Its Impacts

I do feel that summers are getting hotter every year, but this year was even hotter and dry and choking.

- A pregnant woman from Muhammad Ameen Umrani Village, Shikarpur

⁷⁹ Hanif, A., Ashraf, T., Khalid Pervaiz, M. Guler, G. Prevalence and risk factors of preterm birth in Pakistan April 2020, Volume 70, Issue 4 Journal of the Pakistan Medical Association, https://jpma.org.pk/article-details/9723?article_id=9723

⁸⁰ Abbas, F., Kumar, R., Mahmood, T. et al. Impact of children born with low birth weight on stunting and wasting in Sindh province of Pakistan: a propensity score matching approach. Sci Rep 11, 19932 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-98924-7. For global rates see World Health Organization, Preterm Birth, factsheet <u>https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/preterm-birth#:~:text=An%20estimated%2015%20million%20babies%20are%20born%20too%20early%20every.of%20preterm%20birth%20(1).</u>

November 14, 2022. For definitions of "wasting" and "stunting" see World Health Organization, health topics, Malnutrition https://www.who.int/health-topics/malnutrition#tab=tab_1

⁸¹ Aziz, A., Saleem, S., Nolen, T.L. et al. Why are the Pakistani maternal, fetal and newborn outcomes so poor compared to other low and middle-income countries. Reprod Health 17 (Suppl 3), 190 (2020). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12978-020-01023-5

It is getting hotter every year and we were not able to sleep well this summer due to this. It has also changed our eating patterns as most of the time, we do not feel hungry.... And it affects my mood as I easily get infuriated and depressed in hot summers.

— A lactating woman from Kumbar Mohallah Village, Shikarpur

Due to a lack of information about the causes [and] preventive measures and my personal experience, I would rate [extreme heat] as a very big problem ... especially in rural areas where communication channels are limited.

- A pregnant woman from Marjan Zia, Mohallaha Morani, Shikarpur

All the women interviewed for this study said extreme heat was worsening every year. They said that extreme heat undermined well-being for everyone in their families and communities but was most harmful for people exposed to more heat (for example, through their work) or who had additional vulnerabilities such as illness or pregnancy. Interviewees also noted that extreme heat had implications for their family's economic well-being, including by making wage earners less productive at work.

Gendered and unpaid "women's" work exposed interviewees to additional heat, including cooking over hot fires and fetching water, which was needed in greater volumes for cooling. Females also had fewer cooling options than men.

Heat was often associated not only with constant discomfort, but also with poor mood. Unremitting high temperatures without cooling was miserable and adversely affected sleep quality. Pregnancy made heat and working in the heat harder to endure and looking after and breastfeeding babies more difficult and stressful, which adversely affected the psychological well-being of the mothers interviewed.

General Harms

When asked who was worst affected by heat, the women interviewees often began answering by noting that harms were felt by all, including by everyone in their families. "The extreme dryness causes dehydration, headache, and fatigue and lethargy," said a pregnant woman from Mohallaha Morani in Shikarpur, speaking generally about the harms of heat. Her list of adverse experiences echoed that of many other interviewees. "My entire family, including my mother and children, fell sick in the recent heatwave. Many people in our community complained about fever, dehydration, and malaria," described a respondent from Kumbar Mohallah Village in Shikarpur. Children, as well as people with pre-existing illnesses, were also often understood to be hard-hit by heat.

"I was impacted the worst by the extreme heat in my family. I have some health issues [Hepatitis C], which have made me more vulnerable to being impacted by the extreme heat," told a lactating interviewee.

Extreme heat was also linked with worse sleep for everyone in our women interviewees' families, although pregnant women and mothers described additional difficulties.

Economic Consequences for Poor Families

The economic implications of higher temperatures for their families caused respondents to worry about the future. "Increased periods of extreme heat will impact our future as it takes a toll on productivity," said a pregnant woman from Muhammad Ameen Umrani village. "Agriculture is the most affected sector. Due to the unavailability of water, crop production will also decrease."

The 2022 extreme heatwave hit at a critical time, during the final period of the growing season, extensively impacting the agricultural sector.⁸² Globally, extreme heat severely harms agricultural

⁸² World Weather Attribution, report, Climate Change made devastating early heat in India and Pakistan 30 times more likely. May 23, 2022 India Pak-Heatwave-scientific-report.pdf (worldweatherattribution.org) (accessed March 24, 2023)

productivity, which in turn reduces economic output and exacerbates poverty.⁸³ Low income communities in India and Pakistan are especially vulnerable to extreme heat because about 60 percent of India's workforce and about 40 percent of Pakistan's are in agriculture, where the bulk of labor is outdoors.⁸⁴ Like laborers worldwide, these workers must make the difficult choice between working in dangerously high temperatures or forgoing their livelihoods.⁸⁵

A female medical officer (who sees only female patients) working with the People's Primary Health Initiative (PPHI), a government-funded NGO that provides much of the primary healthcare services in Sindh, noted that she often saw women agricultural workers who had come to her clinic because of extreme heat. "On a monthly basis, I receive 10 to 15 female patients with heat stroke who were working in hot weather," she said. She also said that she noticed a rise in overall patient numbers during high temperature weather.

One of the respondents, a mother, including of a baby born in April 2022, said that her family worries most about her husband during high temperatures. She said he has a kidney disease that makes him more vulnerable to extreme heat. "He fell unconscious, and we were not able to get him treated properly due to our poverty," she said. "[His health] gets worse during extreme heat, [but] he is a day laborer and has to work even in extreme heat as we do not have any other livelihood sources."

Challenges for Unpaid Labor

Extreme heat is becoming a major issue these days as women's [outdoor] workload has increased as we are responsible for collecting [more] water because water consumption has increased due to hot summers. [This] makes us weak and dehydrated. I do all household chores, such as cooking, taking care of the children and livestock, collecting water, but I feel the heat the most during cooking as we use firewood, which also increases the temperature.

- A Lactating Woman from Mohallaha Morani, Shikarpur

All the interviewees for this study worked in their homes, including by cooking, cleaning, carrying water, and providing childcare. Extreme heat made them feel more exhausted and less able to work. Below, we describe how being pregnant, and/or breastfeeding, worsened women's experiences of extreme heat while laboring in fields or in the home in ways that are often gendered.

Subsistence Farming

Most interviewees worked as subsistence farmers, either in the fields (for example, planting rice) or with livestock. A respondent told us that she struggled with the heat while performing household chores, including carrying water, but she felt hottest when she used the grass-cutting machine in the afternoons to prepare fodder for the livestock. Another respondent hailing from the same area, also found agricultural work, namely rice harvesting, to be the most taxing.

Carrying Water

According to interviewees, extreme heat created more work for them while making them feel weaker and less able to complete necessary tasks. One such task was collecting and transporting water, of which more is needed during hot weather, especially for bathing. "I fell sick and felt touchy and sensitive due to continuous sweating caused by dry weather," described a respondent who was

 ⁸³ I International Labour Organization, Working on a Warmer Planet, The Impact of Heat Stress on Worker Productivity and Decent Work.
 Geneva, ILO, 2019, https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms_711919.pdf
 ⁸⁴ World Weather Attribution, report, Climate Change made devastating early heat in India and Pakistan 30 times more likely. May 23, 2022

India Pak-Heatwave-scientific-report.pdf (worldweatherattribution.org) (accessed March 24, 2023)

⁸⁵ World Weather Attribution, report, Climate Change made devastating early heat in India and Pakistan 30 times more likely. May 23, 2022 <u>India Pak-Heatwave-scientific-report.pdf (worldweatherattribution.org)</u> (accessed March 24, 2023)

pregnant at the time of the interview. "I somehow managed it by taking frequent baths with water and increased water intake to cool off."

Some respondents had handpumps in their household compounds and did not need to carry water long distances. However, they noted that they still needed to jump up and down to work the lever to get the water flowing. In addition, as the pump's location is fixed, pumping water in the shade is not always an option.

Cooking

Cooking, which is typically done inside and without fans or other cooling devices, is especially hot work. Several interviewees struggled the most with extreme heat when cooking, mostly over wood burning fires. "I feel the heat the most during cooking as it causes temperatures to rise, which makes me lethargic and dehydrated," told an interviewee. Another interviewee described the problem by pointing out that the only way to stay cool was not to cook, but this was "not possible because if we do not cook food, then how we will survive?"

Child Care Work

According to ICRC, care work such as "caring for infants or the elderly tends to be less adaptable to dangerously hot conditions ... [and] not amenable to breaks or adjustments in working hours."⁸⁶ Our findings reflected the struggles of women to care for the most vulnerable in their families, highlighting how extreme heat is adding a further labor and stress to unpaid care work. In particular, interviewees experienced negative feelings or moods, including about their children and motherhood, and sleep loss.

Many interviewees also linked heat to feeling depressed or angry, often in connection with childcare, which is already stressful and emotionally taxing work. Women were already burdened with managing household chores and childcare; however, the situation became harder due to the extreme heat that negatively affected the interviewees' moods and made them feel bad while doing this work. "As the only woman in the household, it became challenging to take care of a baby along with routine chores," said a lactating woman. "And extreme heat further made it more difficult as I feel tired and stressed during those days."

A respondent from Kumbar Mohallah village, Shikarpur recounted the additional challenges in taking care of both her household obligations and her new baby when it was very hot in June and July. "I turned out to be easily irritated and aggressive," she said. From Kumbar Mohalla Village, Shikarpur another respondent said the heat worsened her financial worries, which began after the floods destroyed their home and her family had to rent a place to live. When asked how the heat affected her mental health, she said: "I noticed many changes in my mood, especially when I breastfed my child, and I was not able to manage payments due to the additional expenses from renting. I often take out my anger on the children, but when my anger cools down, I realize that I should not beat them."

Poor sleep is another problem that extreme heat exacerbates. Pregnant women and mothers of babies are already at risk for poor sleep because of physiological changes during pregnancy and infant care needs postpartum.⁸⁷ Adequate sleep is crucial for all human health, and for expecting and new mothers, poor maternal sleep is linked to postpartum depression and may be linked to worse birth outcomes and poorer infant health.

 ⁸⁶ United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).p21
 ⁸⁷ Silvestri R, Aricò I. Sleep disorders in pregnancy. Sleep Sci. 2019 Jul-Sep;12(3):232-239. doi: 10.5935/1984-0063.20190098. PMID: 31890101; PMCID: PMC6932848. Maghami, M, Shariatpanahi, SP, Habibi, D, et al. Sleep disorders during pregnancy and postpartum depression: A systematic review and meta-analysis. Int J Dev Neurosci. 2021; 81: 469–478. https://doi.org/10.1002/jdn.10118

Unfortunately, several interviewees cited loss of sleep at night because of the discomfort of heat. "Our sleep patterns were affected by the hot summers, which made us concerned. I easily get infuriated, so it has also affected my mood," said the wife of a butcher in Kumbah Mollah Village, Shikarpur who was pregnant at the time of the interview. "It becomes difficult to get good sleep in these hot summers and women often suffer from lack of sleep," informed another respondent from the same area.

Mothers face additional obstacles to sleeping adequately during heat. Mothers had to perform additional work to keep children, especially highly vulnerable babies, cool by using hand fans made from woven palm leaves. "We women are supposed to manage [hot nights] by using hand fans to get our children to sleep," a respondent from Kumbar Mohalla village, Shikarpur highlighted. These cooling efforts were constant, including at night, after exhausting hot days.

Several interviewees said their worst anger or mood swings occurred around long periods of cooling their children with homemade fans. "I noticed many mood changes, especially when I have to get my children sleep," said one mother. Two interviewees noted that the anger experienced while fanning their children—while feeling exhausted and hot themselves—adversely affected how they felt about their children and mothering.

Maternal and Children's Health Consequences

Women, especially pregnant women, are the most affected by extreme heat. If a child is sick at home, everybody is concerned, but if a female is sick, nobody cares about her because of our patriarchal society. The patriarchal mindset is one in which you just care about your kids, house, and fields. Also, there is much poverty, and females, even when pregnant, have to work in the fields.

- District Manager, People's Primary Health Initiative (PPHI)

Extreme heat impacted expecting and new mothers in several ways, described below.

Maternal Mental Health

Mental health is a major problem within maternal health and can affect more than just the mother. For example, maternal depression is associated with worse health for the pregnant person and may also harm the baby and other family members.⁸⁸

According to the World Health Organization (WHO), "perinatal (defined as the period of pregnancy and for the year after birth) anxiety and depression in the perinatal period are common, affecting an estimated 1 in 10 women in high-income countries and one in five in low- and middle-income countries."⁸⁹ Rates in Pakistan may be even higher.⁹⁰ The WHO also notes that high levels of stress or constantly living in stressful conditions can affect physical and mental health and that natural disasters are also associated with worse maternal mental health.⁹¹

Although mental health conditions in expecting and new mothers are common, most women do not receive the care they need for various reasons, including that mental health conditions are not

and 28-36% of women experience postnatal depression.

⁸⁸ For example, one study noted: "[i]nfants are dependent on their mothers for breastfeeding, physical care, comfort and social interaction. Infant development is compromised if a mother is insensitive or unresponsive to the infant's behavioural cues and needs. In low- and lowermiddle-income countries, maternal depression is associated with higher rates of malnutrition and stunting, diarrhoeal diseases, infectious illnesses, hospital admissions, lower birth weight and reduced completion of immunization schedules among infants." Prevalence and determinants of common perinatal mental disorders in

women in low- and lower-middle-income countries: a systematic review

⁸⁹ https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240057142

⁹⁰ Fisher J, Cabral de Mello M, Patel V, Rahman A, Tran T, Holton S, Holmes W. Prevalence and determinants of common perinatal mental disorders in women in low- and lower-middle-income countries: a systematic review. Bull World Health Organ. 2012 Feb 1;90(2):139G-149G. doi: 10.2471/BLT.11.091850. Epub 2011 Nov 24. PMID: 22423165; PMCID: PMC3302553.General statistics show that in Pakistan's rural areas, 25–48% of women experience antenatal depression

⁹¹ World Health Organization, Geneva, WHO guide for integration of perinatal mental health in maternal and child health services, 19 September 2022 https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240057142 (accessed July 28, 2023)

identified or treated because maternal health providers are not trained and specialists are not available.⁹² Community support and family support, and "[e]mpathetic, competent health-care providers who treat women with respect and dignity" as well as a sense of agency in the pregnant women, including "feeling informed and able to make decisions," are all protective against such conditions.⁹³

As mentioned above, interviewees repeatedly linked extreme heat with worsened mood or other mental health concerns. "I believe that somehow, the extreme heat was also a contributing factor in my mood swings and exhaustion during pregnancy," a respondent pointed out. Unhappiness was reported in connection with poor sleep because of heat, stress over economic or health consequences, the misery of working in high temperatures, and/or despair at the prospect of an ever-hotter future.

Several interviewees expressed their worries about the vulnerability of their children and babies, which added to their stress, during both the day and night. Worries about extreme heat harming young children are well-placed (see sections "Maternal Health and Birth Outcomes" and "Children's Health" above). Respondents further recounted difficulties around breastfeeding and extreme heat (examined in more detail below) and also worried about older children who struggled to cope with extreme heat, sometimes fell ill, and suffered decrease in appetite.

Dehydration

I suffered from dehydration, nausea, vomiting, and severe headaches [caused by extreme heat], which made my pregnancy more difficult. We managed it by visiting the hospital [so I could] get treatment. The doctor administered an IV treatment to address the symptoms, which kept me hydrated somehow. [Heat] is a major problem now ... affecting our health.

- A Lactating Woman from Mahboob, Kumbar Mohalla Village, Shikarpur

Interviewees reported that being pregnant made it harder to bear extreme heat. Many said that high temperatures often made them feel unwell, dizzy, dehydrated, tired, or lethargic during their pregnancy.

"Although I did not faint, [I felt like I] was about to die in the hot summers," informed a respondent further adding that she often felt lightheaded and fatigued when she was hot during her pregnancy. Dehydration was one reported concern. A respondent from Kumbar Mohalla Village, Shikarpur pregnant at the time of the interview, felt sick and dehydrated and worried that the heat was negatively impacting her overall health. Two interviewees were diagnosed with dehydration during their pregnancies. Another resident of the same area required an intravenous drip for dehydration, which she believes was due to the extreme heat. "[The heat] also made me feel bad about being pregnant as my pregnancy experience got more complicated and worse in the recent heatwave," she said. As discussed above, dehydration increases the risk of premature birth. Complaints voiced by one respondent of dehydration and nausea from the very hot weather were echoed by other interviewees.

A respondent who was pregnant at the time of interview said: "I wish I could change my pregnancy months and do this during the winter." Like her, another respondent also voiced that: "Sometimes I feel that women should not get pregnant during hot summers."

⁹² World Health Organization, Geneva, WHO guide for integration of perinatal mental health in maternal and child health services, 19 September 2022 <u>https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240057142</u> *accessed July 28, 2023)

When health-care providers in MCH services are trained to identify symptoms of mental health conditions and to deliver appropriate interventions during routine contacts during the perinatal period, they can address the treatment gap in PMH care and improve mental and physical health outcomes for women and their children. Routine screening and general psychosocial support from MCH providers are appropriate for all women in the perinatal period, ensuring that they feel able to discuss and manage their mental health struggles. More intensive or specialized treatment is appropriate for women with longer-term, more severe mental illnesses.⁹³ Ibid

Worries about Fetal Development

Many interviewees worried about the effects of hot weather on their gestating baby's health. According to one respondent, sometimes she did not feel her baby move when she herself was experiencing "severe weakness." She believes the hot weather contributed to both problems. She reported visiting the hospital frequently during her pregnancy when she felt her fetus was not moving as much as normal. She linked the reduced fetal movement as well as her tiredness, weakness, and lack of appetite to extreme heat.

Some interviewees had a loss of appetite, which was particularly concerning during their pregnancies, a time when women have extra nutritional needs. Several interviewees worried about this. One respondent reported eating less while pregnant because she felt dizzy and unwell because of the heat.

Interviewees who had other illnesses while pregnant told us that high temperatures exacerbated those conditions. This was the case for a young mother from Mohalla Morani, Shikarpur, who had malaria in her fourth month of pregnancy, and another one also from the same area, who suffered from anemia during her pregnancy and fainted from "weakness" twice. She said the heat made the condition feel worse.

Breastfeeding

My baby was healthy when he was born, but he became weak or unhealthier during hot months. It was very difficult to breastfeed him, and I sometimes fell sleep without feeding my baby due to [my own] weakness and exhaustion. [In the heat,] I fell sick and stopped taking food as I didn't feel a need to eat, and this affected lactation. — A Lactating Woman from Kumbar Mohalla Village, Shikarpur

Extreme heat not only changed how interviewees experienced pregnancy, but also created obstacles to breastfeeding their babies.

All the interviewees with babies said that because of the hot weather, breastfeeding became less comfortable, they felt more lethargic, and their babies became less cooperative. Several, respondents said that the heat made them eat less, which they believed impacted their milk supply. As one respondent reported that she ate less in the heat, which affected lactation, and that sometimes the heat made her so tired that she slept without feeding her baby.

Interviewees told us about the impact on their babies of their exhaustion and what some felt was inadequate breastfeeding. One interviewee found it hard to eat in the heat, which made her too tired to breastfeed as much as she would have liked, and which she believes contributed to her baby becoming weaker and less healthy between May and June. Another's baby lost weight because she could not properly feed her. "My baby was born healthy and beautiful, but due to severe heat and lack of care from me, she turned out weak in recent hot summers," she said. Yet another reported not only "exhaustion," but also soreness related to the heat, causing her to breastfeed her baby less than recommended, which she believed made her baby unwell.

Exclusive breastfeeding for the first several months of life provides a host of health benefits for the baby, such as antibodies against diseases, protection from water-borne diseases and protection against future diseases like diabetes.⁹⁴ As a result, exclusive breastfeeding for the first six months is one of the most effective interventions to promote adequate growth. Breastfeeding also has important health benefits for the mother, such as reduced rates of some cancers.⁹⁵

A 2022 global survey of breastfeeding practices and perceptions of infants' changing needs in times of hot weather found that mothers supplement breastmilk with other liquids or foods when they feel

⁹⁴World Health Organization, https://www.who.int/health-topics/breastfeeding#tab=tab_3

⁹⁵ https://www.emro.who.int/pak/pakistan-news/breastfeeding-gives-babies-the-best-possible-start-in-life-and-breastmilk-works-like-ababys-first-vaccine.html

their babies are not getting an adequate supply of breastmilk or are thirsty.⁹⁶ The study's authors worried about the addition of water, which can be dangerous since it often contains harmful bacteria or other disease-causing agents.

Although the Pakistani health system has recognized the importance of breastfeeding, it is not the norm in the first six months. According to a 2018 government survey, only 20 percent of children born during the last two years were breastfed within one hour of birth and fewer than half were exclusively breastfed for six months; instead, the median duration of breastfeeding was only 1.6 months.⁹⁷ A study on low rates of breastfeeding and exclusive breastfeeding in Pakistan recommended: "there is dire need to consider the maternal socioeconomic status and peer counseling in order to enhance exclusive breastfeeding."⁹⁸ A qualitative study on barriers to breastfeeding in a rural area in Sindh Province found a range of reasons for reduced breastfeeding, including low knowledge about benefits and techniques to breastfeed more easily (such as baby positioning), poor maternal nutrition, maternal work such as in agriculture, and short intervals between pregnancies.⁹⁹ The authors also noted that women in their focus groups often said they supplemented with animal milks or other foods and water when they felt their baby was not getting enough milk or was still hungry. The authors said the perception that the baby was hungry or thirsty could be heightened by extreme heat.

Safe and affordable alternatives to breast milk are necessary, especially where breastfeeding is not feasible. However, affordable infant formula is often not available in poorer rural areas, leaving mothers with few safe options.¹⁰⁰

Struggles with breastfeeding because of heat may also impact maternal mental health. As well as providing the benefits outlined above, a recent systematic review found that breastfeeding was generally associated with positive effects on maternal mental health (although not always, such as when there was discordance between expectations of breastfeeding and actual experiences or when women were stigmatized or made to feel guilty for not wanting to breastfeed).¹⁰¹ A study in India found that the risk of postnatal depression was greater among mothers who had experienced difficulty breastfeeding.¹⁰²

We saw maternal health impacts in our interviews. As mentioned, the heat also worsened mothers' moods, which in turn affected their ability or desire to breastfeed their babies. One respondent highlighted that she experienced depression, which she blamed, at least partly, on extreme heat which, for example, made her find breastfeeding difficult and stressful.

Managing Extreme Heat

[Heat] is a major problem ... it has increased women's workload as we women are supposed to manage each and every thing.... I feel heat the most during cooking in the afternoon, especially in making chapatis or rotis, and while working in the field.

⁹⁶Edney JM, Kovats S, Filippi V and Nakstad B (2022) A systematic review of hot weather impacts on infant feeding practices in low-and middle-income countries. Front. Pediatr. 10:930348. doi: 10.3389/fped.2022.930348

⁹⁷ Pakistan Ministry of Health 2018. For more on low breastfeeding in Pakistan see UNICEF Media Centre Breastfeeding: A Key to Sustainable Development. [(accessed on 31 October 2018)];2016 Available online: <u>https://www.unicef.org/pakistan/media 10018.html</u>

⁹⁸ Arif, S., Khan, H., Aslam, M. et al. Factors influencing exclusive breastfeeding duration in Pakistan: a population-based cross-sectional study. BMC Public Health **21**, 1998 (2021). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-021-12075-y

⁹⁹ Riaz, A., Bhamani, S., Ahmed, S. et al. Barriers and facilitators to exclusive breastfeeding in rural Pakistan: a qualitative exploratory study. Int Breastfeed J **17**, 59 (2022). https://doi.org/10.1186/s13006-022-00495-4

¹⁰⁰ Riaz, A., Bhamani, S., Ahmed, S. et al. Barriers and facilitators to exclusive breastfeeding in rural Pakistan: a qualitative exploratory study. Int Breastfeed J **17**, 59 (2022). https://doi.org/10.1186/s13006-022-00495-4

¹⁰¹ The Effects of Breastfeeding on Maternal Mental Health: A Systematic Review Megan Yuen, Olivia J. Hall, Grace A. Masters, Benjamin C. Nephew, Catherine Carr, Katherine Leung, Adrienne Griffen, Lynne McIntyre, Nancy Byatt, and Tiffany A. Moore Simas Journal of Women's Health 2022 31:6, 787-807

¹⁰² Patel V, Rodrigues M, DeSouza N. Gender, poverty, and postnatal depression: a study of mothers in Goa, India. Am J Psychiatry 2002;159:43–7. doi:10.1176/appi.ajp.159.1.43 PMID:11772688

Sometimes, I want to leave everything behind and just rest, but it's not possible as we have to feed our children. Therefore, we cannot rest or stop working. — A Pregnant Woman from Kamran Mohalla Morani, Shikarpur

Interviewees told us about their heat management methods, which included using electric fans, bathing in cool water, distracting themselves, or resting. Their ability to control how often they used these methods was limited by work demands and erratic electricity supply.

Most interviewees had electric fans in their homes, but the fans often did not work because of power cuts. Consequently, many had bought solar panels to at least have a working fan during the day. "We have ... solar panels to survive hot summers in the daytime, while at night, we sleep in the courtyard under the open sky as the solar panels do not work at night," highlighted one.

One interviewee reported using solar panels for daytime cooling. She however noted some problems with this strategy: "It's not a permanent solution and it only works in the daytime. Moreover, the majority of households in the community do not have solar panels, so they keep suffering from extreme heat."

A respondent from Mohalla Morani, Shikarpur remarked that avoidance and fans were their only coping methods: "We can only avoid the worst of the heat by not going outside during peak hours [of hot weather] and by sitting under the fan after cooking food and other vigorous tasks in middle of the day.

Using water to cool off was another essential strategy. One respondent shared a view held by others: "We do not have many resources to reduce the amount and impact of extreme heat; therefore, we prefer local arrangements, such as using handmade straw fans and frequently taking baths, to cool off."

When possible, women took rests; however, domestic duties prevented pregnant women from resting as frequently as they would have liked. One interviewee captured this experience: "Taking rest and doing nothing always helped me cope better with the heat during my pregnancy; however, I was unable to continuously rest due to my domestic responsibilities," she said.

Unfortunately, all these efforts to mitigate the impacts of the heat were temporary fixes. Women tried to distract themselves with other activities when their efforts failed.

One respondent bathed in cool water, which helped, but she ultimately felt there was little she could do to make herself feel better in the extreme heat. "I keep myself busy doing household chores or visiting neighbors to gossip so that I can avoid the mood swings," she said.

Another respondent said: "I managed [feeling hot] by keeping myself busy in different [and routine] activities as we know that there is no other way out. "The flooding further complicated heat management because families had lost some of the ways they usually used, such as fans, due to the flooding. The flooding not only displaced her family, but also permanently destroyed their electric fans. "We had electric fans, which we used when there was electricity, but these fans were damaged in the recent floods when our roof collapsed," she said. A respondent residing in Kumbar Mohalla Village, Shikarpur, on the other hand, still had a fan, but the flooding damaged their solar panel.

Access to Information about Protective Measures

Pregnant people and their families need access to information about extreme heat's impacts—both in general health and on maternal and newborn health—so they understand the risks and how to protect themselves.

Some health care providers are giving advice to pregnant women about extreme heat. A female Medical Officer of PPHI in Shikarpur said that her clinic conducts trainings on heat health to groups of women and that she advises pregnant women to finish their work before midday during periods of extreme heat and to not leave their houses without good reason; if they must leave their house, they

should put a wet cloth over their heads. A Lady Health Worker in Shikarpur said that she and other Lady Health Workers advise pregnant women to drink more and avoid hard labor in the heat.

The District Manager for People's Primary Health Initiative (PPHI), said that although heat stroke interventions has been established, "we don't have exclusive program specifically for pregnant women or young babies." Whereas, the Assistant District Health Officer for Shikarpur said that community health workers, including Lady Health Workers, provided health messaging about extreme heat, including "protect yourself from heat by covering your head, use water and stay at home during peak hours of heat." He also said that families are advised to use oral rehydration salts during heatwaves. According to him, this work—providing heat advisories along with literature and oral rehydration salt sachets, iodine-enriched salt, and water purifying tablets—takes place every year in March.

However, only one of our interviewees reported seeing or hearing any public messaging on health impacts of extreme heat generally. She said her family had received messages with warnings about heatwaves on their mobile phones. None of the women we interviewed received any health warnings about heat from any maternal health provider.

Gendered Differences in Access to Cooling

According to the interviewees, the men in their community had ways of cooling off that women could not access because of gender-based sociocultural restrictions. For example, men can go to hotels or community centers to cool off, but women are not allowed to spend time in these locations. The restrictions are so pervasive that even sitting under trees in public is difficult for women.

According to one respondent her only option was the school: "I used to go [to the school] and spend time alone as it makes me happy and relaxed."

Another one explained how the sociocultural norms prevented women's access to public places: "There are no public places or parks in our community for women and kids. Moreover, we do not have permission to visit public places to cool off." Instead, she sat under the trees in her courtyard to try and stay cool.

Women's clothing is another gender-based risk in extreme heat. The ICRC noted that "social and cultural expectations such as heavy layering of clothes, predispose many women and children to other direct heat-related risks."¹⁰³

Gender-based traditional practices pose similar challenges. Women in rural Sindh commonly perform *chilla*, a traditional practice where, for the first 40 days after giving birth, they rest without bathing. Thus, women practicing *chilla* during periods of extreme heat miss bathing as an important cooling method. "I did *chilla*, and it was not a pleasant experience in the extreme summer weather," informed one interviewee. Another one, who fainted while performing a *chilla*, considered those 40 days to be her worst experience of extreme heat.

¹⁰³ United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies, and the Red Cross Red Crescent Climate Centre, "Extreme Heat: Preparing for Heatwaves of the Future" October 2022 <u>https://www.unocha.org/publications/report/world/extreme-heat-preparing-heatwaves-future-october-2022</u> (accessed July 28, 2023).

Recommendations

Global Recommendations

- All countries should cut greenhouse gas emissions to keep global warming below 1.5°C. Countries should urgently work to protect pregnancy and other human health and well-being from the climate crisis. The failure to urgently curb greenhouse gases will make it more difficult for low-income countries to adapt to extreme heat predictions in a manner that fully protects the rights to life, health, and well-being.
- All countries with historical or current high emissions should provide funding to address harms caused by the climate crisis to low- and middle-income countries and should meet their human rights obligation to address harms to marginalized populations in their own territories. These resources should supplement international cooperation funds provided, such as those by the UN humanitarian system, to address emergency and development needs in low-income countries as envisaged in international human rights treaties.
- All countries should take more measurable steps to include maternal and newborn health in their climate crisis adaptation planning and resourcing. Countries should initiate a robust international process to establish—and share learnings and other information from—pilot interventions. Countries should also launch and fund more community-based research aiming to better protect maternal and newborn health in low-income countries or otherwise marginalized communities from extreme heat and other climate harms.
- The international sexual and reproductive health and rights movement and the international reproductive justice movement should do more to center climate justice and the right to a healthy environment in their work.

Recommendations for Pakistan

District, provincial, and national governments, together with non-governmental service providers and international donors, should implement interviewees' **recommendations for increased access to cooling**, including by:

- Providing cash transfers for climate disasters, including ahead of heatwaves so that families can take time off work if they need to or pay for cooling, additional water, and the like.
- Providing a steady supply of electricity that is enough to at least run fans for 24 hours a day. Consider subsidizing the purchase of solar panels and batteries to store power for the nighttime.
- Providing access to adequate drinkable water for staying hydrated in high temperatures and for frequent bathing as a cooling mechanism.
- Creating infrastructure to help cool housing and neighborhoods, which could include tree planting within compounds, using materials that stay cooler for building, or painting surfaces, such as roofs white.
- Running public information campaigns on inexpensive cooling techniques for people and their home, such as use of foot baths and wet cloths and shuttering windows.
- Running maternal and newborn health-centered heat awareness campaigns with information and advice for women and their families.
- Creating cooled spaces where women and children can spend time, such as schools after the school day or in spaces associated with clinics and work.
- Ensuring clinics, hospitals, and other medical establishments providing reproductive health services, including prenatal and obstetric care, are cool spaces and open for visitation by pregnant people, newborns and others needing cooling.

In consultation with the most-affected communities, the District, provincial, and national governments, together with national and international NGOs and other non-governmental service providers and their financial supporters, should **build programming on extreme heat into maternal health services.** Specifically, they should take measurable steps to:

- Ensure all government officials working in health or addressing the climate crisis are aware of the maternal and newborn health implications of extreme heat, and the climate crisis more broadly.
- Work to develop knowledge on the links between extreme heat and maternal/newborn health in the non-governmental health sector, including through trainings, meetings, and conferences.
- Include maternal and newborn health in all government planning and spending in response to the climate crisis, and actively include health providers and women as experts in addressing climate needs.
- Undertake a scoping study to better understand what different actors are already doing to address extreme heat and other climate harms to maternal and newborn health across Pakistan and what gaps remain.
- Map cooling capacities of low-income communities, and consult with women, healthcare providers, and other stakeholders to develop ways forward.
- Ensure that maternal health—and sexual and reproductive health more broadly—and newborn health is fully included in all climate adaptation planning, especially any climate health adaptation planning. Specific efforts could include:
 - Education for men, women, pregnant people, families, and communities on the harms of extreme heat, including on pregnancy and newborn health.
 - Education for families that covers the importance of reducing heat exposure, including during domestic and other work, during pregnancy.
 - Additional support and resources as well as training for Lady Health Workers and other perinatal community health workers so they can better provide pregnant people with information, services, and connections to climate adaptation programs.

Recommendations for Future Research

Universities and other academic institutions, governmental and non-governmental research institutions should **fund**, **conduct**, **and widely disseminate research at the intersection of extreme heat and maternal and newborn health**, including on:

- Unpaid work, including childcare and subsistence farming, work that takes place in the home or in informal settings, and paid work in workplaces such as factories and agriculture, and each's relationship with pregnancy and newborn health.
- How to better protect pregnant women and girls from extreme heat and to better involve women and girls, including pregnant people, in climate action (advocacy and adaptation efforts) in lowand middle-income settings.
- The intersection of maternal mental health and possible interventions.
